



The Mayor's K-12 Smart City Challenge

Inspired by the SA Tomorrow Comprehensive Plan 

2024 SCORING RUBRIC

Scores available to judges for each rubric line item.

Rubric column	Excellent	between	Good	between	Fair or poor
Score	5	4	3	2	1

RUBRIC: RESEARCH PITCH DECK

Each line carries equal weight.

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<i>Problem</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LOCALIZED to San Antonio! ● Clear ● Quantified (number of people affected, dollar impact, etc., as appropriate) ● Stated independent of solution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Localized to San Antonio ● Mostly clear ● Some measurement of problem is provided ● Stated independent of solution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Not clear, or states the solution as the problem (“begs the solution”)
<i>Solution</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clear ● Concise ● No more technical that absolutely necessary 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Somewhat clear ● Could be more concise or less technical 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Not clear what is being proposed as the solution
<i>How it Works</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clear ● Concise ● Audience could now explain to someone else 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Somewhat clear ● Could be more concise ● Audience might be able to share with others 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Not clear how the solution works to solve the problem
<i>Technical analysis</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Detailed ● Considers all parts of the system surrounding the product/service/strategy ● Convinces audience it will work 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Somewhat detailed ● Partially considers surrounding system ● Might convince the audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Little or no light shed on whether solution will work



The Mayor's K-12 Smart City Challenge

Inspired by the SA Tomorrow Comprehensive Plan 

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<i>Market analysis</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clear evidence of speaking with potential customers, end users, and other stakeholders • Detailed market information resulting from those conversations—things you only learn by talking to people in the market 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some evidence of speaking with potential customers, end users, and other stakeholders • Useful information resulting from those conversations, perhaps lacking detail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Little evidence of engaging with the market • Generic/blanket statements that are not compelling
<i>OVERALL: Progress made</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant information has been collected about technical feasibility and market interest. • Submission was on time 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some information has been collected • Submission was on time or close 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Little or no information has been collected, or submission was more than three days late
<i>OVERALL: Level of detail</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information is detailed and when applicable, quantified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some information is detailed, other is general or not quantified when it should be 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information is very general

FINAL PITCH DECK AND PRESENTATION

Overall Scoring Formula

Localized to San Antonio!	10%
Mentorship participation	10%
Each slide (Problem, Solution, ...)	40% (for all slides)
Pitch deck overall / story	10%
Verbal presentation	10%
Broad team participation	10%
Creative effort	10%



The Mayor's K-12 Smart City Challenge

Inspired by the SA Tomorrow Comprehensive Plan 

RUBRIC: Slides (40% of total)

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<i>Team Introduction</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All members named Each person's specific contribution is clear 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All members named Each person's contribution is covered, but the details are less than clear 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Team members were not introduced, and/or it's not clear what role each member played
<i>Problem</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear Quantified (number of people affected, dollar impact, etc., as appropriate) Stated independent of solution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mostly clear Some measurement of problem is provided Stated independent of solution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not clear, or states the solution as the problem ("begs the solution")
<i>Solution</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear Concise No more technical than absolutely necessary 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Somewhat clear Could be more concise or less technical 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not clear what is being proposed as the solution
<i>How it Works</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear Concise Audience could now explain to someone else 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Somewhat clear Could be more concise Audience might be able to share with others 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not clear how the solution works to solve the problem
<i>Technical analysis</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed Considers all parts of the system surrounding the product/service/strategy Convinces audience it will work 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Somewhat detailed Partially considers surrounding system Might convince the audience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Little or no light shed on whether solution will work
<i>Market analysis</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear evidence of speaking with potential customers, end users, and other stakeholders Detailed market information resulting from those conversations—things you only learn by talking to people in the market 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some evidence of speaking with potential customers, end users, and other stakeholders Useful information resulting from those conversations, perhaps lacking detail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Little evidence of engaging with the market Generic/blanket statements that are not compelling



The Mayor's K-12 Smart City Challenge

Inspired by the SA Tomorrow Comprehensive Plan 

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<i>Next steps</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clear go-forward recommendation ● Accompanied by specific steps ● Names who could carry the idea forward (person, company, city department, etc.—by name!) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Go-forward recommendation ● Some next steps provided ● Some idea who could carry project forward 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● No clear recommendation, or very vague statement of next steps

RUBRIC: Other rubric items (60% overall)

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<u>Localized to San Antonio!</u> 10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A local San Antonio instance of a problem or issue consistent with the year's theme was clearly identified and articulated. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A San Antonio connection to the problem or issue was addressed in the team's presentation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● No San Antonio connection was proactively established.
<i>Mentorship participation</i> 10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Proactively engaged with mentors ● Direct communication of status and challenges ● Follow-up on mentor comments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Engagement with mentors ● Good discussion of project ● Limited follow-up on mentor comments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Little or disorganized engagement with mentors
<i>Pitch deck overall / story</i> 10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Visually clean ● Spelling and grammar clean ● Tells a story across all slides 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Mostly clean in look, spelling, grammar ● Somewhat organized as a story 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Not visually clean, multiple spelling or grammar errors, not logically organized
<i>Verbal presentation</i> 10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Thoughts concise and clear ● Good voice projection ● Steady posture 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Somewhat clear ● Adequate projection ● Adequate posture 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Consistently poor communication of thoughts, voice projection, or posture
<i>Broad team member participation</i> 10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● All members contributed ● All members' roles clear 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Most members contributed ● Roles generally clear 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A limited number of team members did the vast majority of the work



The Mayor's K-12 Smart City Challenge

Inspired by the SA Tomorrow Comprehensive Plan  SA TOMORROW

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Fair or Poor</i>
<i>Creative effort 10%</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clear presence of creative thought around identified challenges, and translation into tangible outcomes • And/or, obvious and effective creative approach to presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indication of creative thought with some impacts • And/or, a somewhat creative presentation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited or no evidence of creativity